Proceedings of the 29th Annual UCLA Indo-European Conference

Los Angeles November 3rd and 4th, 2017

Edited by

David M. Goldstein Stephanie W. Jamison Brent Vine

with the assistance of

Angelo Mercado

HEMPEN VERLAG BREMEN 2018 Cover illustrations: Wheeled vehicles depicted on Bronze Age vessels and petroglyphs, from Kuzmina, E. E. (2007) *The Origin of the Indo-Iranians*, Leiden, Brill; Fig. 34. Reproduced with the kind permission of the author.



OF OXFORD

Bibliografische Information Der Deutschen Nationalbibliothek Die Deutsche Nationalbibliothek verzeichnet diese Publikation in der Deutschen Nationalbibliografie; detaillierte bibliografische Daten sind im Internet über http://dnb.d-nb.de abrufbar.

ISBN: 978-3-944312-64-4

www.hempen-verlag.de

© 2018 Hempen Verlag, Bremen Das Werk einschließlich aller seiner Teile ist urheberrechtlich geschützt. Jede Verwertung außerhalb der engen Grenzen des Urheberrechtsgesetzes ist unzulässig und strafbar. Das gilt insbesondere für Vervielfältigungen, Übersetzungen, Mikroverfilmungen und die Einspeicherung und Verarbeitung in elektronischen Systemen. Umschlaggestaltung: Detemple Design, Igel b. Trier Gesamtherstellung: Hubert & Co, Göttingen Gedruckt auf alterungsbeständigem Papier Printed in Germany

Contents

Preface vii
Brent VINE and H. Craig MELCHERT Remembrance: Vyacheslav IVANOV 1
Stephanie W. JAMISON Remembrance: Hanns-Peter SCHMIDT
Phillip BARNETT and Andrew Miles BYRD A Markedly Different Approach: An Experimental Look at the Rarity of PIE */b/
Joseph F. ESKA Celto-Germanic Lexis in Light of Laryngeal Realism
Benjamin W. FORTSON IV -σον-of-a-Gun: The Greek 2sg. <i>s</i> -aorist Active Imperative
Riccardo GINEVRA Old Norse Sigyn (*seik ^u -n-iéh ₂ - 'she of the pouring'), Vedic °sécanī- 'pouring', Celtic Sēquana, and PIE *seik ^u - 'pour'
Petra GOEDEGEBUURE The Packagers - <i>ant</i> - and - <i>a</i> -, and the Origin of Split Ergativity in Hittite (and Lycian)
Ryan HEARN Mixed Headedness in Tocharian and Its Implications for PIE Reconstruction
Stefan HÖFLER A Look over Lat. <i>umerus</i> 'shoulder'
Laura MASSETTI Another Avatar of Mātariśvan? On the Hesychian Gloss Ἰθας, Ἱθαξ (ι 387 L)147
Thomas MOTTER The Structure of Relative Clauses in Early Germanic
Thomas OLANDER Connecting the Dots: The Indo-European Family Tree as a Heuristic Device

1

Contents

)3
23
59
i9
1

Another Avatar of Mātariśvan? On the Hesychian Gloss ἴθας, ἴΙθαξ (ι 387 L)*

LAURA MASSETTI

Center for Hellenic Studies and Københavns Universitet

1. This paper concerns a puzzling gloss recorded in the corpus of the ancient lexicographer Hesychius, which mentions a character named Ithas or Ithax:

Hsch. 1 387 L

Ίθας· ὁ τῶν Τιτήνων κῆρυξ. Προμηθεύς. τινὲς Ἰθαξ

 It^has : the herald of the Titans. Prometheus. Some (say) It^haks^1

In this work I intend to provide a possible etymology of the name and to explain why Ithas is identified with Prometheus and called 'herald' at the same time. For this purpose, I am going to focus on the linguistic and textual data about Prometheus's fire-theft in Greek. I will also try to frame the gloss in its inherited background by comparing the Greek phraseological and mythological material with the Rigvedic evidence for Mātariśvan's fire-theft. A close look at the phraseological components that Prometheus/Ithas and Mātariśvan have in common will cast new light on the apparently isolated tradition preserved by Hesychius.

2. The etymology of Ithas is clear: the noun can be traced back to a Proto-Indo-European root 'kindle', commonly reconstructed as $h_2 e_i d^{h_2} (LIV^2 259)$,² but better reconstructed as $h_1 a_i d^{h_2}$, i.e., as a secondary root with the shape

^{*} A special thank you to José Luis García Ramón, Stanley Insler, Gregory Nagy, Georges-Jean Pinault, and Charles Stocking for their valuable help and suggestions. All remaining mistakes are, of course, my responsibility. When not otherwise indicated, the reference texts for the printed translations are Jamison and Brereton 2014 (RV) and Most 2007 (Hesiod).

¹ The obscure literary context of the gloss has long been the subject of scholarly debate; cf. Welcker (1849:II.415), followed by Pohlenz (1916:588 n.2), M. West (2002:113–4), and Debiasi (2004:103 n.239), who all consider the gloss to be part of Eumelos's *Titanomachy* (= Eum. fr. 5 W) because Tιτήνων (for Τιτάνων) usually occurs in hexameter poetry. Differently, the gloss is recorded as the title of a lost satyr play on Prometheus in the *TGF* (II 8i IΘAΣ vel IΘAΞ). Providing an answer to this difficult question goes beyond the scope of this paper, which will not engage in further speculation.

² Cf. Latte 1966:354; see also Morani 1983:42.

* $h_1a\underline{i}$ - d^{h_-} 'make warm' in light of Hitt. $a\bar{a}ri$ 'is warm', *inuzi* 'makes warm', which show no trace of an initial laryngeal two (LIV^2 259 n.1). Derivatives of * $Haid^{h_-}$ are widely attested in IE languages.³ Some of the nominal derivatives can be framed in the Caland system (Nussbaum 1976:35–6); cf. $\alpha i\theta i \omega \psi$ 'Aethiopian' (lit. 'whose face is burnt'),⁴ Ved. $v\bar{i}dhr\dot{a}$ - 'clear sky'; OIr. $\dot{a}ed$ (u-stem, gen. aeda) 'fire'; Ved. $\dot{e}dhas$ - (ntr.) 'firewood', $idhm\dot{a}$ - 'id.'.⁵

The zero-grade of the root is displayed by several Greek lexemes,⁶ namely, the Mycenean man's name (MN) *I-ta-ra-jo /Itharaios/* (PY Jn 431.10); the Alphabetic Greek MN ^{*}Iθαρος (Sardis+; cf. Robert 1963:45–7); the adjective iθαρός 'cheerful, glad' (Alc. fr. 5.8, 58.18 V, Call. *Aetia* fr. 85.16 H, Hsch. 1 386 L), 'pure' (Simmias fr. 25.6 P [= *AP* 15.22.6]); the verb iθαίνω 'warm up, cherish' (Hsch. 1 382, 399 L); the substantive iθή· εὐφροσύνη "*ith*ć: mirth" (Hsch. 1 392 L), reflecting a semantic evolution from 'kindle/heat' to 'cherish/comfort', not unparalleled in Greek; cf. ἴθαινε θυμόν "cherish the heart!" (*P.Ox.* 1.61, matching the compound iθαινόθυμος, Herod. III 2.260.10 L);⁷ and θάλπησι θυμόν "warms the heart" (B. fr. 20b.6–7 M).⁸

³ See the dossier of LIV^2 259, completed with the material of LIV Addenda s.v. $*h_2 e_i d^{h}$ -.

⁴ Lesky 1959:33, criticized by Beekes (1995–6:28).

⁵ Av. aēsma- 'firewood' reflects *Haidh-s-mo- (Hoffmann and Forssman 2004:95, Catt 2014: 39–41). Lat. aestus (gen. -ūs) might reflect *Haidh-tu- or *Haidh-s-tu-; see Nussbaum 1998: 527: u-substantivization of a to-stem; cf. Gmc. *aista- 'hot' > OE āst 'kiln'.

⁶ The entire dossier presented here was discussed by Peters (1980:109–10), according to whom the forms should be kept separate from $\alpha i\theta \omega$.

⁷ Nominal *-*aró*-derivatives pairing with *-*anio/e*-verbs, beside *-°*ró*-derivatives pairing with *-°*nio/e*-verbs, may point to an original *r/n*-stem (cf. *GEW* and *EDG* s.v. αἰθήρ), according to a well-attested pattern (Risch 1974:290, García Ramón 1992:191–3); cf. ὕδρος 'water-snake', Ved. *udrá*- 'aquatic animal', etc., ὑδαρός* 'watery' (Hsch. v 59 L) :: ὑδραίνω (<*ὑδαίνω) 'to wash, water', *udanyáti* 'to irrigate, water' ::: ὕδωρ 'water', *udán*- 'water', *udaká*- 'id'. Accordingly, it has been proposed that ἰθαρός 'cheerful, pure' ::: ἰθαίνω 'cherish, heat' points to a heteroclite ἴθαρ (García Ramón p.c.); cf. Hsch. v 385 L ἴθαρ· εὐθέως, ταχέως ''*it*^{*har*}: forthwith, quickly,'' whose meaning may point to a possible misunderstanding or secondary contamination between *ἴθαρ and *ἶθαρ, an itacistic rendering for εἶθαρ 'at once, forthwith' (*Il.* 5.337+).

⁸ Dubious zero-grade congeners are κακιθά· λιμηρά "kakit^há: hungry," κακιθής· ἄτροφος ἄμπελος "kakit^hés: non-nutritious grape-vine (?)," κακιθές· χαλεπόν, λιμηρές "kakit^hés: difficult, hungry" (Hsch. κ 306–8 L). The compound might be interpreted as a possessive form, meaning 'having a bad (κακός) burning/hunger', or 'having a drying/consuming burning/hunger' with a first compound member *κακ° going back to PIE *kenk- 'burn (?)'; cf. Eng. *hunger*. Indeed, hunger is *traditionally* described as burning; cf. αἶθοψ λιμός 'fiery hunger' (Hes. *Op.* 363), λιμός αἴθων 'id.'; cf. Hes. fr. 43a.5–7 MW, Aeschin. *in Ctesiph.* 184.7, Call.

3. If ^{*}Ιθας was paroxytone, as proposed by Latte (1966:354), it reflected the type Θόας, -αντος, probably based on a thematic stem. Alternatively, the original form of the name might be ^{*}Ιθάς (M. Schmidt 1860:350) with accent retraction, perhaps influenced by ^{*}Ιθαξ. An original PN ^{*}Ιθάς could reflect the type φυγάς or Δρυάς: a proto-form ^{*}iθάς, -άδος, ^{*} 'heating, glowing' (?) would exist beside iθή ^{'*}warmth/heat' and αἴθω 'kindle, heat' in the same way as φυγάς 'exile, fugitive' exists beside φυγή 'flight' and φεύγω 'flee'.⁹ Alternatively, if ^{*}Ιθαξ was the original form of the name, an *ak*-form could synchronically pair with a thematic name ^{*}iθός or a feminine iθή, just as πίδαξ 'spring' pairs with a feminine ^{*}πιδή, probably underlying πιδήεις 'rich in springs' and πιδάω 'gush forth' (Kölligan 2016:119–23, 2017:369–70).

4. The link between the semantic field of 'warmth/heat' and Prometheus can be easily reconstructed on the basis of the Greek sources about the Titan. According to the Hesiodic accounts, Prometheus steals fire in a "fennel-stick," the $v\alpha\rho\theta\eta\xi$,¹⁰ e.g.,

Hes. Th. 566-7

κλέψας ἀκαμάτοιο πυρὸς τηλέσκοπον αὐγήν ἐν κοΐλῷ νάρθηκι [...]

Stealing the far-seen gleam of tireless fire in a hollow fennel stalk¹¹

Prometheus is thus considered the 'fire-lighter' (πυρκαής, A. *TGF* III **204a–7a) and 'fire-bringer' (πυρφόρος, S. *OC* 55)¹² par excellence. Besides, he is referred to as the discoverer of fire-sticks in a later Greek source:

h.Cer. 66–7, *Schol. in Lycophr.* 1396, on which see Levaniouk 2000:36–9. On ἀκάκητα as a possible congener of PIE **kenk*- see Massetti: in preparation.

⁹ Cf. Rau (2004:139), who presents other *ad*-substantives or adjectives pairing with both zero-grade verbs and zero-grade feminines or adjectives, such as iλλάς (f., Hom.) 'rope, band', (S.), adj. 'close-packed' :: ĭλλω 'wind' (S.+) :: iλλός 'squinting'; λαμπάς (f., A.+) 'torch' :: λάμπω (Hom.+) 'shine' :: λαμπή (A.+) 'torch'; τυπάς (f., S.+) 'mallet' :: τύπτω (Hom.+) 'strike, beat' :: τυπή (Hom.+) 'blow', τύπος (Hdt.+) 'stamp, impression'.

¹⁰ The νάρθηξ is a fennel stalk used to carry the fire and is identified with the thyrsus; cf. E. Ba. 146–8 πυρσώδη φλόγα πεύκας/ ἐκ νάρθηκος ἀΐσσει/ δρόμῷ "(Bacchus's) flaming pine torch shoots a flame from the fennel wand, while running."

¹¹ Cf. also Hes. Op. 52.

¹² Both epithets are transmitted as the titles of lost plays of Aeschylus; see Ussher 1977:291.

D.S. 5.67.2

Ίαπετοῦ δὲ <u>Προμηθέα</u> τὸν παραδεδομένον μὲν ὑπό τινων μυθογράφων ὅτι τὸ πῦρ κλέψας παρὰ τῶν θεῶν ἔδωκε τοῖς ἀνθρώποις, πρὸς δ' ἀλήθειαν εὑρετὴν γενόμενον <u>τῶν πυρείων, ἐξ ῶν ἐκκάεται τὸ πῦρ</u>

And to Iapetus was born <u>Prometheus</u>, of whom tradition tells us, as some writers of myths record, that he stole fire from the gods and gave it to the men, though the truth is that he was the <u>discoverer of fire-sticks</u>, from which <u>fire is kindled</u>.

5. While a possible overlap between Ithas and Prometheus is easily conceivable, the link between "the herald of the Titans" and Prometheus is apparently missing. Prometheus is never called a herald or a messenger because he does not carry any message in the literary sources in our possession.¹³ In order to solve this issue, Reinhardt (1949:41) and Kerényi (1963:50–5) proposed an overlap with the Olympian god Hermes, the 'messenger' (ἄγγελος, Hom.+) and the 'herald' (κῆρυξ, Hes.+) of immortal gods. To be sure, Prometheus shares a variety of characteristics with Hermes, namely:

- a. The discovery of fire-sticks (see §4 above), ascribed to Hermes in the fourth *Homeric Hymn*; cf. Έρμῆς τοι πρώτιστα πυρήια πῦρ τ' ἀνέδωκε (v. 111) "it was Hermes who first delivered fire-sticks and fire."
- b. The invention of sacrifice or of sacrificial allotment, attributed to Prometheus in Hes. *Th.* 535–60 and to Hermes in *h.Merc.* 4.115–41.
- c. The association with thievery, e.g., Hes. *Th.* 566 κλέψας ἀκαμάτοιο πυρὸς τηλέσκοπον αὐγήν "(Prometheus,) who stole the beam of the untiring fire, which can be seen from afar"; Hippon. fr. 3a G Ἐρμῆ … φωρῶν ἑταῖρε "Oh Hermes … companion of thieves!"
- d. A number of common epithets, e.g., ἀκάκητα 'guileless, gracious (?)', which applies *exclusively* to Hermes (*Il.* 16.185, *Od.* 24.10, Hes. fr. 23 MW) and to Prometheus (Hes. *Th.* 614), or compounds with the structure [ποικιλο°THOUGHT]: ποικιλομήτης 'having various wiles' (Hermes, in

150

¹³ A. Pr. 199–221 mentions the diplomatic activity of Prometheus. Accordingly, Prometheus was a sort of mediator between the gods and the Titans. For Eumelus's poem as the source of some themes found in A. Pr., see S. West 1994:129–49.

h.Merc. 4.155), ποικιλόβουλος 'having a changeful counsel' (Prometheus, in Hes. *Th.* 510).

Such significant common characteristics undeniably imply that Hermes and Prometheus have similar roles in narratives involving the same traditional themes, i.e., the invention of sacrifice and the discovery of fire through deceit and theft (Sowa 1984:200–1). However, they are not conclusive for reconstructing how the label "herald of the Titans" came to apply to Prometheus. Despite the genealogical relation between him and Hermes (Stocking 2017:92–100),¹⁴ the two characters were *always* kept apart in Greek. Above all, they always maintained a different "status": Prometheus a primordial god, a Titan; Hermes the son of Zeus. The source of the association between Prometheus and the act of carrying messages should be sought elsewhere.

6. In this regard, some iconographical and literary data may be enlightening.



Vase painting from a lost pelike, Morchini collection, Turin (Gerhard 1868:pl. 21.2)

In a lost vase painting (pelike of the Morchini collection, once in Turin) preserved only in a drawing by Eduard Gerhard (1868:pl. 21.2), the central figure, which, according to Beazley (1939:633), is to be identified with Prometheus or,

¹⁴ Hermes is the son of Maia, daughter of Atlas (*h.Hom.* 18.3–4, Hes. *Th.* 938), who, like Prometheus, is the son of Iapetus (cf. Hes. *Th.* 507–10).

maybe, Dionysus, carries a fennel stalk in his right-hand¹⁵ and a thyrsus in the left. The character wears winged boots and is surrounded by satyrs. The gestures of the frantic satyrs match those of the satyrs surrounding Prometheus in other vase paintings, but no parallel can be found for the winged boots,¹⁶ a standard accessory of messengers in Greek vase paintings and literary sources.

Further literary passages suggest that the association between Prometheus and fire lies at the basis of his identification with "the herald of the Titans." In some literary sources, the delivery of a message and the act of "carrying fire" are explicitly connected. Herodotus (8.98.1–2) compares the Persian riding post to the Greek torch races: the messengers of the $\dot{\alpha}\gamma\gamma\alpha\rho\dot{\eta}\omega\nu$ -post pass their charge from hand to hand "as in the Greek torch-bearers' race in honor of Hephaestus" (κατά περ ἐν Ἔλλησι ἡ λαμπαδηφορίη τὴν τῷ Ἡφαίστῷ ἐπιτελέουσι).¹⁷ In a similar way, in Aeschylus's *Agamemnon* the news about Troy being set on fire by the Achaeans travels up to Mycenae, as if it were a torch race:

A. Ag. 281-316

"Ηφαιστος, "Ιδης λαμπρὸν ἐκπέμπων σέλας φρυκτὸς δὲ φρυκτὸν δεῦρ' ἀπ' ἀγγάρου πυρὸς ἕπεμπεν: [...] [...] τοιοίδε τοί μοι <u>λαμπαδηφόρων</u> νόμοι, [...] <u>νικῷ δ' ὁ πρῶτος καὶ τελευταῖος δραμών</u>. τέκμαρ τοιοῦτον σύμβολόν τέ σοι λέγω, ἀνδρὸς <u>παραγγείλαντος</u> ἐκ Τροίας ἐμοί

(Clytemnestra:) — Hephaestus, sending a bright blaze on its way from Mount Ida; and then from that <u>courier-fire</u> beacon sent on beacon all the way here. [...] Such, I tell you, were my dispositions for <u>this torch-relay</u>,

¹⁵ This detail would match Prometheus's iconography in E. Ph. 1121–2: δεξιᾶι δὲ λαμπάδα/ Τιτὰν Προμηθεὺς ἔφερεν "in his right (hand) he carried a torch, like the Titan Prometheus."

¹⁶ In one vase painting (*LIMC* VII.2 s.v. *Prometheus* 12 [= Beazley 1939:pl. 15], lekanis, Berlin Staatliches Museum) Prometheus, surrounded by satyrs, wears a short chiton and boots.

¹⁷ As Charles Stocking points out to me (p.c.), in Hdt. 6.105–7 Philippides, carrying the message from Marathon, claims to have seen the god Pan, who is celebrated in Athenian torch races. Pan is not a fire-god, but is associated with Hermes, both genealogically (cf. *h.Hom.* 19.1–5+) and phraseologically; see, e.g., the collocation Ἀρκαδίας μεδέων "guardian of Arkadia," referring to Hermes (*h.Merc.* 4.2+) and Pan (Pi. fr. 5.1 SM).

[...] <u>the first and the last runner were alike victorious!</u> Such, I tell you, is the evidence and the token that my husband <u>has transmitted</u> to me from Troy.¹⁸

Although neither Herodotus nor Aeschylus mentions Prometheus, their passages still tell us something about him. Indeed, Hephaestus, Athena, and Prometheus were worshipped together in the Athenian festivals that included torch races (Dougherty 2006:50), as confirmed by Pausanias:

Paus. 1.30.2

Προμηθέως βωμός, καὶ θέουσιν ἀπ' αὐτοῦ πρὸς τὴν πόλιν ἔχοντες καιομένας λαμπάδας

(There is) an altar to Prometheus, and from it they run to the city carrying burning torches.

Finally, Hyginus seems to retain a connection among Prometheus's theft, the torch race, and the idea of carrying a message:

[Hyg.] Astr. 2.15.1.5–15

Prometheus [...] deuenit ad Iouis ignem; quo deminuto et in ferulam coniecto, laetus ut uolare, non currere uideretur, ferulam iactans [...]. <u>Itaque</u> <u>homines adhuc plerumque qui laetitiae fiunt nuntii, celerrime ueniunt</u>. Praeterea in certatione ludorum cursoribus instituerunt ex Promethei consuetudine ut currerent lampadem iactantes

Prometheus [...] approached the fire of Jove, and with a little of it shut in a fennel-stalk, he came joyfully tossing the stalk, seeming to fly, not to run [...]. Up to this time, men who bring good news usually come with speed. In the rivalry of the games they also make it a practice for the runners to run, shaking torches after the manner of Prometheus.

To the modern reader of the passage, the connection between Prometheus's speed, the "joyful message," and the torch race seems unjustified. Given the fact that $i\theta\eta$ meant 'mirth' (Hsch.) and was etymologically related to 'Ithas', the insistence on Prometheus's joy (*laetus, laetitia*) in Hyginus appears to be a remarkable coincidence. Did Hyginus and Hesychius's lexicon depend on the same source, which associated Ithas and 'mirth' (*ithé*)? Attractive as it might appear, this suggestion remains highly speculative. The connection between carrying messages and fire is, however, clearly confirmed by Hyginus's passage.

¹⁸ For a commentary on the entire passage see Fraenkel 1950:153–69.

7. To sum up:

- a. [°]Ίθας and [°]Ίθαξ can be traced back to PIE **Haid^h* 'kindle', which underlies also Ved. *edh* 'id.'. Indeed,
- b. Prometheus is the fire-kindler (πυρκαής, A.) and the fire-bringer (πυρφόρος,
 S.) par excellence. Additionally, he was considered the discoverer of firesticks (εύρετήν ... τῶν πυρείων, D.S.).
- c. Prometheus and Ithas share an association with fire. Their action of "carrying fire" was reproduced by athletes, through the torch races performed during the *Prometheia* in Athens. We can conclude that Prometheus and Ithas are messengers *because they are ultimately associated with fire*.

8. The comparative phraseological analysis of the Vedic passages about Mātariśvan reveals that the Greek and Vedic episodes of the fire-theft share some significant coincidences. Mentioned twenty-seven times in the Rigveda, Mātariśvan is sometimes identified with Agni, e.g., RV 3.26.2ab *tám śubhrám agním ávase havāmahe, vaiśvānarám mātaríśvānam ukthyàm* "we invoke the beautiful Agni for help, who is Vaiśvānara and praiseworthy Mātariśvan,"¹⁹ or as the one who brought Agni to Bhrgu or Manu, e.g., RV 1.60.1d *rātím bharad bhŕgave mātaríśvā* "Mātariśvan brought him (: Agni) as a gift to Bhrgu," while he is identified with the wind in the *Atharvaveda*.

Indeed, it is likely that Mātariśvan meant originally 'master of the fire'. Stanley Insler²⁰ proposed to reconstruct an original * $\bar{a}tar$ -*iśvan*- 'Lord of the fire', with a second compound °*iśvan*- belonging to Ved. *iś*- 'master' (cf. OAv. *isvan*- 'lord') and a folk-etymological transformation of the first compound member; cf. RV 3.29.11c mātaríśvā yád ámimīta mātári ''he (: Agni) (becomes) Mātariśvan when he has assumed his measure in his mother."²¹

¹⁹ Cf. also RV 1.96.4, 1.164.46, 3.5.9. Mātariśvan is identified with Brhaspati in RV 1.190.2.

²⁰ I am very grateful to Prof. Insler for sharing his ideas with me (p.c.).

²¹ The folk etymology found in the *Nirukta* (Roth 1852:111) is 'swelling in the mother (fire-stick)'; see Nagy 1990:103. Parpola (2004–5:26–7) mentions Insler's etymology, proposing a re-interpretation of a sequence *m ... *ātaríśvan-. The etymology of the name is still the subject of debate; see Scarlata 1999:540–1: *meh2t₈-h2t₈-h2t₈-uen- 'who has power over the mothers'; Pinault 2011:284–92: *dméh2-t(e)r°h2tk-uen- 'who disposes of the timber', whom I thank for the bibliographical reference.

As first noticed by Johanna Narten (1960:132–5), Mātariśvan's theft is often described using Ved. *mathⁱ* 'rob',²² which might go back to the same root as Gk. Проµ $\bar{\alpha}\theta\epsilon\dot{\nu}\varsigma$, PIE **math*₂- 'rob (?)'.²³ The outcome -*t^h*- notated $\langle\theta\rangle$ from a sequence *-*th*₂- is problematic in Greek.²⁴ Nevertheless, the etymology of Prometheus as 'Forethought' *ex Graeco ipso*, as related to µ $\alpha\nu\theta\dot{\alpha}\nu\omega$ 'learn', like his brother's name, 'E π µµ $\theta\epsilon\dot{\nu}\varsigma$ 'Afterthought', may have played a role in reshaping *Προµ $\bar{\alpha}$ τε $\dot{\nu}\varsigma$ (the putative outcome of *° $m\bar{a}th_2$ -) to Προµ $\bar{\alpha}\theta\epsilon\dot{\nu}\varsigma$.

9. Not only do Prometheus and Mātariśvan have the same role in the myth of the discovery of fire through theft, but their achievements are described by means of the same collocations within their respective mythological traditions, namely,

- a. [to STEAL FIRE]: Prometheus: Hes. Op. 55 χαίρεις <u>πῦρ κλέψας</u> καὶ ἐμὰς φρένας ἠπεροπεύσας "[Zeus:] you (: Prometheus) are pleased <u>that you have stolen fire</u> and beguiled my mind"; Mātariśvan: RV 1.148.1a <u>máthīd</u> yád <u>īm</u> vistó <u>mātariśvā</u> "since with effort <u>Mātariśvan stole him (: Agni).</u>"
- b. [to STEAL FIRE from AFAR]: Prometheus steals fire visible from afar; cf. Hes. Th. 566 κλέψας ἀκαμάτοιο πυρὸς τηλέσκοπον αὐγήν "by stealing the far-seen gleam of tireless fire," while Mātariśvan steals the 'far-radiant' (vibhā́va-, RV 1.148.1d) fire, or brings fire 'from afar'; cf. RV 1.128.2fg yám mātariśvā mánave parāváto, devám bhā́h parāvátah</u> "he whom Mātariśvan (brought) to Manu from afar—the god he brought from afar."²⁵
- c. [to STEAL FIRE CONCEALED]: Prometheus steals the fire that Zeus had concealed; cf. Hes. Op. 50–1 κρύψε δὲ πῦρ· τὸ μὲν αὖτις ἐὺς παῖς Ἰαπετοῖο/

²² Both Mātariśvan and the wind appear in a collocation with mathⁱ; cf. AVŚ 2.30.1ab yáthedám bhűmyā ádhi, týnam vắto mathāyáti "wie der Wind hier das Gras von der Erde hinweg raubt"; cf. AVP 9.25.13, AVP 10.9.26, commented on by Narten 1960:126–8.

²³ On common points between Prometheus and Mātariśvan see Roth 1852:112, Kuhn 1859:8–44, Bergaigne 1878:I.52–7, Charpentier 1911:69–83, Kuiper 1971:85–98, who criticizes the former hypothesis of an overlap between Prometheus and Mātariśvan. See Melchert 2016 on a possible lengthened grade °*māth*- in the name of Prometheus.

²⁴ In some cases, the second laryngeal seems to cause aspiration of the preceding voiceless stop; cf. 2nd sg. perf. ending *-*th*₂*e* > -θα: Gk. οἶσθα 'you know'; cf. Ved. *véttha* 'id.' In other cases, however, the aspiration does not seem to occur, e.g., Gk. πλατύς 'broad' < **plth*₂*us* vs. Ved. *prthú*- 'id.'.

²⁵ Cf. also RV 3.9.5cd, where the form *mathitá*-, referring to fire, can be interpreted as 'robbed' or as 'churned'; see Jamison and Brereton 2014:481.

<u>ἕκλεψ</u>' ἀνθρώποισι "And (Zeus) <u>concealed fire</u>; but the good son of Iapetus <u>stole it</u> for human beings." Mātariśvan steals the fire, which was hiding; cf. RV 3.5.10cd yádī bhýgubhyaḥ pári <u>mātariśvā</u>, gúhā sántam havyaváħaṃ samīdhé "when <u>Mātariśvan</u> kindled <u>him hiding</u> from the Bhŗgus, conveying the oblation."

d. [to BRING (*b^her-) – FIRE]: Prometheus is the fire-bringer par excellence; cf. S. OC 55–6 [...] δ' ό πυρφόρος θεός/ Τιτὰν Προμηθεύς "the fire-bringer god, the Titan Prometheus." As proof of this, Prometheus's Argive avatar was called Phoroneus, the '(fire-)bringer',²⁶ cf. Paus. 2.19.5 οὐ γάρ τι ὁμολογοῦσι δοῦναι πῦρ Προμηθέα ἀνθρώποις, ἀλλὰ ἐς Φορωνέα τοῦ πυρὸς μετάγειν ἐθέλουσι τὴν εὕρεσιν "For they do not admit that fire was given to mankind by Prometheus, but insist on assigning the discovery of fire to Phoroneus." Ved. bhar (also á-bhar) often describes Mātariśvan's achievement; cf. RV 1.93.6ab ányám divó mātariśvā jabhār_a, amathnād anyám pári śyenó ádreḥ "Mātariśvan bore the one here from heaven; the falcon stole the other from the rock."

As emphasized by Insler (p.c.), the onomastic and phraseological evidence speaks in favor of a common tradition about the fire-theft, which lived on in different ways within two IE languages: the Greek material emphasized the theft through the *agent* names, Prometheus 'the fire-thief', Phoroneus 'the fire-bringer'. Therefore, the tradition about Prometheus's punishment as a consequence of his crime is widely developed in the Greek literary tradition. Differently, in the Vedic one, it is the *verb*, not the agent, which expresses the dim memory of the legend of the Lord of Fire.

10. Significantly, Mātariśvan shares with Ithas and Prometheus the association with PIE $*Haid^{h}$ - 'kindle', as shown in the following passages:

RV 3.5.10

<u>úd astambhīt samídhā nấkam rsvó</u> <u>a'gnír</u> bhávann uttamó rocanấnām

²⁶ Names in -ωνεύς can pair with thematic stems in -ωνός, which, in turn, may point to an original *n*-stem as a derivational basis; cf. κολωνός 'hill' (*h.Cer.* 2.272+) : Κολωνεύς (toponym in *IG* 2. 944.48); μελεδωνός 'attendant, guardian' (Hdt. 3.61) : μελεδωνεύς 'id.' (Theoc. 24.106). A MN Phoronos is preserved in Suid. φ 616: Φορωνεύς: ὄνομα. καὶ Φόρωνος, ὄνομα κύριον "*Phorōneus*: name. Also *Phorōnos*, proper name."

Another Avatar of Mātariśvan? On the Hesychian Gloss $I\theta\alpha\zeta$, $I\theta\alpha\xi$ 157

yádī bhýgubhyah pári <u>mātarísvā</u> gúhā sántam havyavāham <u>samīdhé</u>

<u>Towering</u>, Agni has propped up the vault of the sky through his kindling, becoming the highest of the lights, when <u>Mātariśvan kindled him</u> hiding from the Bhrgus, conveying the oblation.

RV 1.143.2

sá jāyamānah paramé v_iyòmany <u>āvír agnír abhavan mātaríśvane</u> <u>asyá krátvā samidhānásya majmánā</u> prá dyāvā śocíh prthiví arocayat

As he was being born in the highest distant heaven, <u>Agni became manifest</u> to <u>Mātariśvan</u>. By the resolve and the might of him as he was kindled, his blaze illuminated heaven and the earth.

As Prometheus was imagined as the "discoverer of fire-sticks" in at least one Greek tradition, it is also significant that the Vedic root-noun *samidh*- commonly denotes the 'kindling stick'; cf. RV 5.6.4ad <u>á</u> te agna <u>idhīmahi</u>, dyumántam devājáram / yád dha syấ te pánīyasī, <u>samid</u> dīdáyati dyávi "Agni, <u>here would we kindle</u> your brilliant and unaging (flame), oh god, so that this <u>kindling stick of yours</u>, admired more, will shine in heaven."

Furthermore, in the *Rigveda* Mātariśvan is called messenger, Ved. $d\bar{u}t\dot{a}$. This term usually describes Agni; cf. RV 1.36.4ab $dev\dot{a}sas tv\bar{a} v\dot{a}runo mitro aryam\dot{a}$, sám $d\bar{u}t\dot{a}m$ pratnám indhate "the gods Varuna, Mitra, and Aryaman kindle you, their primordial messenger." Agni is called $d\bar{u}t\dot{a}$ - because he brings the ritual oblations to the gods and leads the gods to the sacrifice.²⁷

Since Mātariśvan is identified with Agni (H.-P. Schmidt 1968:68–71), he also took over Agni's epithet 'messenger'; cf. RV 3.5.9 úd u stutáh samídhā yahvó adyaud, várşman divó ádhi nấbhā prthivyấh/ mitró agnír ídiyo mātariśvā, á dūtó vakşad yajáthāya devấn "praised, the young one has flared up through his

²⁷ Several Vedic passages (RV 1.36.4, 1.118.1, 5.3.8, 5.8.6, 5.26.6, 7.2.3, 7.3.3, 10.91.11, 10.110.1) document an association between the notion of 'kindling' / 'kindling stick' and those of 'messenger' / 'role of messenger/mission'. Fire is compared to an eagle and a messenger also in one Hittite passage; cf. KUB 43.62 ii 1–10 *paḫhur šāi[t]* [...] ŠA TI₈^{MUŠEN} *iwar ANA* TI₈^{MUŠEN} *ma ḫal[ugaš pait*] "fire became enraged, [...] He sprang up like an eagle, and to the eagle (went as a) messenger" (Melchert 2003:283–4).

kindling, upon the summit of heaven and the navel of earth. <u>To be invoked as</u> <u>Mitra and Mātariśvan, Agni as a messenger</u> will convey the gods to the sacrifice."

In at least one passage, however, "messenger" applies to Mātariśvan as an individual figure, distinct from Agni:

RV 6.8.4cd

ā <u>dūtó agním</u> abharad vivásvato vaiśvānarám <u>mātaríśvā</u> parāvátaķ

<u>The messenger</u> of Vivasvant brought Agni hither—<u>Mātariśvan</u> (brought) Vaiśvānara from afar.

Finally, Mātariśvan is mentioned as the one who brought "the messenger" (: Agni) or as the one who allowed Agni to engage in carrying messages from the men to the gods:

RV 1.60.1

váhnim yasásam vidáthasya ketúm suprāvyàm <u>dūtám</u> sadyóartham dvijánmānam rayím iva prasastám rātím <u>bharad</u> bhýgave <u>mātarísvā</u>

Glorious conveyor and beacon of the rite, pursuing (his ritual duties) well, <u>the messenger</u> who immediately (reaches) his goal, of double birth, celebrated like wealth—<u>Mātariśvan brought</u> him as a gift to Bhrgu.

RV 1.71.4

<u>máthīd yád īm víbhŗto mātarísvā</u> grhé-grhe syetó jényo bhất ấd īm rắjñe ná sáhīyase sácā sánn <u>ấ dūtyàm bhŕgavāno vivāya</u>

When Mātariśvan, borne away, stole him, and he of worthy birth came to be gleaming in every house, after that (the fire) of the Bhrgus undertook the role of messenger, as if for a more powerful king, being associated with him.

11. The comparative analysis of the linguistic and textual data reveals that Ithas/Ithax and Mātariśvan share a limited but still significant number of components:

a. ["]Iθας/"Iθαξ goes back ultimately to PIE **Haid*^h- 'kindle', which underlies Gk. iθή 'warmth/glow', whence 'mirth', and Ved. (*sam*)*edh* 'kindle', which de-

158

scribes one of Mātariśvan's actions in the Rigveda; cf. *mātariśvā* [...] *samīdhé* (RV 3.5.10cd) and *samidh*- 'kindling stick', a tool discovered by Prometheus within the Greek tradition (εύρετήν ... τῶν πυρείων, D.S. 5.67.2).

b. The identification between Ithas and Prometheus essentially relies upon their association with fire. At the same time, Prometheus shares several collocations with Mātariśvan, which can be synoptically presented as follows:

	[STEAL	FIRE	([visible] from AFAR)	CONCEALED]
Prometheus (Hes.)	ἔκλεψε/κλέψο	ις πῦρ/πυρός	αὐγήν τηλέσκοπον	(Zeus) κρύψε
Mātariśvan (RV)	máthīd	agním	parāvátaķ	gúhā sántam
	BRING F	RE]		
Prometheus (S.+)	π	υρφόρος		
Argive tradition	Φορωνεύς			
Mātariśvan (RV)	bharat a	gním		

c. The identification of Ithas and, indirectly, of Prometheus as "the herald ($\kappa \eta \rho \nu \xi$) of the Titans" might be understood in the framework of the *Prometheia* within the Greek tradition, although Ithas is never mentioned in connection with the Athenian torch race. Strikingly, Mātariśvan is directly called $d\bar{u}t\dot{a}$ - 'messenger' in at least one Rigvedic passage (RV 6.8.4cd).

In conclusion, the comparative analysis of the Greek and Vedic textual evidence about the figures connected with the fire-theft within their respective traditions casts light on an obscure Hesychian gloss.

References

- Beazley, John D. 1939. Prometheus Fire-Lighter. *American Journal of Archaeology* 43/4.618–39.
- Beekes, Robert S. P. 1995-6. Aithiopes. Glotta 73/1.12-34.
- Bergaigne, Abel. 1878. La religion védique d'après les Hymnes du Rg-veda. Paris: Vieweg.
- Catt, Adam. 2014. The Derivational Histories of Avestan *aēsma* 'firewood' and Vedic *idhmá*- 'id.' In Stephanie W. Jamison, H. Craig Melchert, and Brent Vine (eds.), *Proceedings of the 25th Annual UCLA Indo-European Conference, October 25th and* 26th, 2013, 39–48. Bremen: Hempen.
- Charpentier, Jarl. 1911. Kleine Beiträge zur indoiranischen Mythologie. Uppsala: Berling.

- Debiasi, Andrea. 2004. L'Epica perduta: Eumelo, il Ciclo e l'occidente. Rome: L'Erma di Bretschneider.
- Dougherty, Carol. 2006. Prometheus. London: Routledge.
- *EDG* = Robert S. P. Beekes. 2010. *Etymological Dictionary of Greek*. 2 vols. Leiden: Brill.
- Fraenkel, Eduard. 1950. Aeschylus, Agamemnon. 3 vols. Oxford: Clarendon Press.
- García Ramón, José Luis. 1992. Griechisch ἰερός (und Varianten), vedisch isirá-. In Robert S. P. Beekes (ed.), *Rekonstruktion und relative Chronologie: Akten der VIII. Fachtagung der Indogermanischen Gesellschaft Leiden, 31.8.–4.9.1987*, 183–205. Innsbruck: Institut für Sprachwissenschaft der Universität Innsbruck.
- Gerhard, Eduard. 1868. Abbildungen zu den gesammelten akademischen Abhandlungen und kleine Schriften. Berlin: Reimer.
- *GEW* = Hjalmar Frisk. 1960–72. *Griechisches etymologisches Wörterbuch*. 3 vols. Heidelberg: Winter.
- Hoffmann, Karl, and Bernhard Forssman. 1996. *Avestische Laut- und Flexionslehre*². Innsbruck: Institut für Sprachwissenschaft der Universität Innsbruck.
- Jamison, Stephanie W., and Joel P. Brereton (trans.). 2014. *The Rigveda: The Earliest Religious Poetry of India*. 3 vols. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Kerényi, Karl. 1963. Prometheus: Archetypal Image of Human Existence. Trans. Ralph Manheim. New York: Bollingen Foundation.
- Kölligan, Daniel. 2016. Trois noms grecs en -ak-: πῖδαξ, λῦμαξ, φύλαξ. In Alain Blanc and Daniel Petit (eds.), Nouveaux acquis sur la formation des noms en grec ancien: Actes du colloque international, Université de Rouen, ERIAC, 17–18 octobre 2013, 117–33. Louvain: Peeters.
 - 2017. Gr. σάλαξ, σκύθραξ und die griechischen Nomina auf -ak-. In Ivo Hajnal, Daniel Kölligan, and Katharina Zipster (eds.), Miscellanea indogermanica: Festschrift für José Luis García Ramón zum 65. Geburtstag, 369–82. Innsbruck: Institut für Sprachwissenschaft der Universität Innsbruck.
- Kuhn, Adalbert. 1859. *Mythologischen Studien* I: Die Herabkunft des Feuers und des Göttertranks: Ein Beitrag zur vergleichenden Mythologie der Indogermanen. Gütersloh: Bertelsmann.
- Kuiper, Franciscus B. 1971. An Indian Prometheus? Asiatische Studien: Zeitschrift der Schweizerischen Asiengesellschaft 25.85–98.
- Latte, Kurt (ed.). 1966. Hesychii Alexandrini Lexicon II: E-X. Haunia: Munksgaard.
- Lesky, Alexander. 1959. Aithiopika. Hermes 87.27-38.
- Levaniouk, Olga. 2000. Aithôn, Aithon and Odysseus. Harvard Studies in Classical Philology 100.25–51.
- *LIMC* = Hans C. Ackermann and the Foundation for the LIMC (eds.). 1994. *Lexicon Iconographicum Mythologiae Classicae* VII/1–2: *Oidipus–Theseus*. Zürich: Artemis.
- *LIV*² = Martin Kümmel and Helmut Rix. 2001. *Lexikon der indogermanischen Verben: Die Wurzeln und ihre Primärstammbildungen*². Wiesbaden: Reichert.

- *LIV Addenda* = Martin Kümmel. 2015. Addenda und Corrigenda zu *LIV*². http://www .martinkuemmel.de/liv2add.html (accessed 27 October, 2017).
- Massetti, Laura. In preparation. Young and Hungry: ἀκάκητα and the Gk. avatars of the IE Fire-god.
- Melchert, Craig. H. 2003. Hittite antaka- 'loins' and an Overlooked Myth about Fire. In Gary Beckman, Richard Beal, and Gregory McMahon (eds.), *Hittite Studies in Hon*or of Harry A. Hoffner Jr., 281–7. Winona Lake, IN: Eisenbrauns.
 - ——. 2016. Lengthened Grades of PIE **CaC* Roots. Paper presented 16 September at the 15. Fachtagung der indogermanischen Gesellschaft, Vienna.
- Morani, Moreno. 1983. Il nome di Prometeo. Aevum 57/1.33-43.
- Most, Glenn W. (ed. and trans.). 2007. *Hesiod, Theogony; Works and Days; Testimonia*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- Nagy, Gregory. 1990. Greek Mythology and Poetics. Ithaca: Cornell University Press.
- Narten, Johanna. 1960. Das vedische Verbum math. Indo-Iranian Journal 4.121-35.
- Nussbaum, Alan J. 1976. Caland's "Law" and the Caland System. Ph.D. diss., Harvard University.
- ——. 1998. Severe Problems. In Jay Jasanoff, Craig H. Melchert, and Lisi Oliver (eds.), *Mir Curad: Studies in Honor of Calvert Watkins*, 521–38. Innsbruck: Institut für Sprachwissenschaft der Universität Innsbruck.
- Parpola, Asko. 2004–5. The Nāsatyas, the Chariot and Proto–Aryan Religion. Journal of Indological Studies 16–17.1–63.
- Peters, Martin. 1980. Untersuchungen zur Vertretung der indogermanischen Laryngale im Griechischen. Vienna: Österreichische Akademie der Wissenschaften.
- Pinault, Georges-Jean. 2011. Mātariśvan: The Vedic Fire-Bird. *Indologica Taurinensia* 37.269–93.
- Pohlenz, Max. 1916. Kronos und die Titanen. Neue Jahrbücher für das Klassische Altertum 37.549–94.
- Rau, Jeremy. 2004 [2010]. The Derivational History of the Greek Stems in -άδ-. Münchener Studien zur Sprachwissenschaft 64.137–73.
- Reinhardt, Karl. 1949. Aischylos als Regisseur und Theologe. Bern: Francke.
- Risch, Ernst. 1974. Wortbildung der homerischen Sprache². Berlin: de Gruyter.
- Robert, Louis. 1963. Les noms indigènes dans l'Asie Mineure gréco-romaine. Première Partie. Paris: Maisonneuve.
- Roth, Rudolf (ed. and comm.). 1852. *Jâska's Nirukta sammt den Nighanțavas*. Göttingen: Dieterich.
- Scarlata, Salvatore. 1999. Die Wurzelkomposita im Rg-Veda. Wiesbaden: Reichert.
- Schmidt, Hanns-Peter. 1968. Brhaspati und Indra: Untersuchungen zur vedischen Mythologie und Kulturgeschichte. Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz.
- Schmidt, Moritz (ed.). 1860. *Hesychii Alexandrini Lexicon, post Ioannem Albertum* II: *E K*. Jena: Maukius.

- Sowa, Cora A. 1984. *Traditional Themes and the Homeric Hymns*. Chicago: Bolchazy-Carducci.
- Stocking, Charles H. 2017. *The Politics of Sacrifice in Early Greek Myth and Poetry*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- *TGF* II = Richard Kannicht and Bruno Snell (eds.). 1981 [2007]. *Tragicorum Graecorum Fragmenta* II: *Fragmenta Adespota, testimonia volumini 1 addenda, indices ad volumina 1 et 2*. Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht.
- *TGF* III = Stefan Radt (ed.). 1985. *Tragicorum Graecorum Fragmenta* III: *Aeschylus*. Göttingen: Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht.
- Ussher, Robert G. 1977. The Other Aeschylus: A Study of the Fragments of Aeschylean Satyr Plays. *Phoenix* 31/4.287–99.
- Welcker, Friedrich G. 1849. *Der epische Cyclus oder die homerischen Dichter*. 2 vols. Bonn: Weber.
- West, Martin L. 2002. 'Eumelos': A Corinthian Epic Cycle? *Journal of Hellenic Studies* 122.109–33.
- West, Stephanie. 1994. Prometheus Orientalized. Museum Helveticum 51/3.129-49.