AETHIOPICA

International Journal of Ethiopian and Eritrean Studies

Edited in the Asien-Afrika-Institut Hiob Ludolf Zentrum für Äthiopistik der Universität Hamburg Abteilung für Afrikanistik und Äthiopistik

by Alessandro Bausi in cooperation with Bairu Tafla, Ulrich Braukämper, Ludwig Gerhardt, Hilke Meyer-Bahlburg and Siegbert Uhlig

17 (2014)

Harrassowitz Verlag · Wiesbaden

Aethiopica. International Journal of Ethiopian and Eritrean Studies welcomes contributions on all aspects of linguistics, philology, history, archaeology, palaeography, religion(s), traditional art and culture as well as ethnology (anthropology) related to the Horn of Africa.

Vignette:

Gold coin of King Aphilas, early 3rd century A.D., as drawn by A. Luegmeyer after the coin in Rennau collection. Weight 2.48 grams, diameter 17 mm.

Articles, reviews, conference reports, notes and all correspondence concerning editorial matters should be sent to:

Aethiopica, Hiob Ludolf Centre for Ethiopian Studies, Universität Hamburg, Alsterterrasse 1, 20354 Hamburg, Germany; Fax: +49 (0)40 42838-3330; E-Mail: aethiopica@uni-hamburg.de.

Contributors are requested to submit their contributions in electronic form and 2 printouts. Additional information can be found at http://www.rrz.uni-hamburg.de/AETHIOPICA.

Only unpublished contributions are accepted for publication. The decision will be made by the editorial management in consultation with the board members and through a peer review process.

All views represented in the papers are those of the authors.

Subscription orders can be placed with booksellers and agencies or directly with Harrassowitz Verlag, 65174 Wiesbaden, Germany; Fax: +49 611 530-999; E-Mail: verlag@harrassowitz.de.

Editorial Team Susanne Hummel Angela Müller Thomas Rave

Editorial Board

David Appleyard, London Rodolfo Fattovich, Napoli Alessandro Gori, Copenhagen Marilyn E. Heldman, Silver Spring Olga Kapeliuk, Jerusalem Richard Pankhurst, Addis Ababa/London Alain Rouaud, Paris Shiferaw Bekele, Addis Ababa Rainer Voigt, Berlin

Publication of this journal was supported by a grant of the Deutsche Forschungsgemeinschaft.

© Otto Harrassowitz GmbH & Co. KG, Wiesbaden 2014

This journal, including all of its parts, is protected by copyright.

Any use beyond the limits of copyright law without the permission of the publisher is forbidden and subject to penalty. This applies particularly to reproductions, translations, microfilms and storage and processing in electronic systems.

Printing and binding by Memminger MedienCentrum Druckerei und Verlags-AG

Printed on permanent/durable paper

Printed in Germany

www.harrassowitz-verlag.de

ISSN 1430-1938

Table of Contents

Editorial	5
Bibliographical abbreviations used in this volume	6
Articles	
ANDREA MANZO, Snakes and Sacrifices: Tentative Insights into the Pre-Christian Ethiopian Religion	7
MICHAEL GERVERS, Churches Built in the Caves of Lasta (Wällo Province, Ethiopia): A Chronology	25
DENIS NOSNITSIN – IRA RABIN, A Fragment of an Ancient Hymnody Manuscript from $M\partial^{\circ}\partial A$ pila (Togray, Ethiopia)	65
AMSALU TEFERA, Colophonic Reflections on Dərsanä Şəyon and Kəbrä Nägäśt	78
STÉPHANE ANCEL – DENIS NOSNITSIN, On the History of the Library of Mäqdäla: New Findings	90
NAMOUNA GUEBREYESUS, Rim Transactions of liqe Bätre: A Preview of the Transactions on Lands in the mäzgäb of Hamärä-Noh	96
MAGDALENA KRZYŻANOWSKA – STÉPHANE ANCEL, Early 20th Century Theological Controversies in Ethiopia: A Letter of the Coptic Metropolitan Petros of 1904	121
MARIA BULAKH – LEONID KOGAN, Towards a Comprehensive Edition of the Arabic–Ethiopic Glossary of al-Malik al-Afdal Part II: New Readings from the Second Sheet	
EWALD WAGNER, Betrachtungen zu Harariner grammatischen Termini	
RAINER VOIGT, Bibliographie zur äthiosemitischen und kuschitischen Sprachwissenschaft XVII: 2012	
Miscellaneous	
STEFAN WENINGER, Die altäthiopischen Personalpronomina der dritten Person Plural in der Funktion als Kopula	190
Personalia	
In memoriam Gideon Goldenberg (1930–2013) (RICCARDO CONTINI)	195
In memoriam Donald Edward Crummey (1941–2013) (IRMA TADDIA)	
In memoriam Amsalu Aklilu (1929–2013) (GETIE GELAYE)	223
Review articles	
JOACHIM CRASS – RONNY MEYER (eds.), Language Contact and Language Change in Ethiopia (GIORGIO BANTI)	227

Table of Contents

ANTONELLA BRITA, I racconti tradizionali sulla «Seconda Cristianizzazione» dell'Etiopia (PIERLUIGI PIOVANELLI)	226
Reviews	236
	246
Pount, Cahiers d'études 5 (STÉPHANE ANCEL)	Z 1 0
Rehabilitation of a 'Decadent' Society (WALTER W. MÜLLER)	240
	249
BARBARA JÄNDL, Altsüdarabische Inschriften auf Metall	255
	255
DAVID W. PHILLIPSON, Foundations of an African Civilisation: Aksum	250
& the Northern Horn 1000 BC-AD 1300 (LUISA SERNICOLA)	258
KAI MERTEN, Das äthiopisch-orthodoxe Christentum: Ein Versuch	
zu verstehen (MAIJA PRIESS)	263
ANDREA NICOLOTTI, Esorcismo cristiano e possessione diabolica	
tra II e III secolo (Alessandro Bausi)	267
GETATCHEW HAILE (ed.), The Homily of Zär'a Ya'əqob's Mäshafä	
Bərhan on the Rite of Baptism and Religious Instruction	
(STEFAN WENINGER)	269
ANAÏS WION, Paradis pour une reine: Le monastère de Qoma	
Fasilädäs, Éthiopie, XVII ^e siècle (LEONARDO COHEN)	273
PETER GARRETSON, A Victorian Gentleman & Ethiopian Nationalist:	
The Life & Times of Hakim Warqenah, Dr. Charles Martin	
(BAIRU TAFLA)	276
SASCHA A. KIENZLE, Ursachen für den eritreisch-äthiopischen	
Grenzkonflikt: Eine historisch-politische Analyse (BAIRU TAFLA)	278
LOVISE AALEN, The Politics of Ethnicity in Ethiopia: Actors, Power and	
Mobilisation under Ethnic Federalism (ULRICH BRAUKÄMPER)	280
JÖRG HAUSTEIN, Writing Religious History: The Historiography of	
Ethiopian Pentecostalism (VERENA BÖLL)	283
DIRK BUSTORF, Lebendige Überlieferung: Geschichte und Erinnerung	
der muslimischen Silt'e Äthiopiens (SUSANNE EPPLE)	288
SOPHIA THUBAUVILLE, Die Wandernde ist eine Kuh: Lebenswege	
von Frauen in Maale, Südäthiopien (ANGELA M. MÜLLER)	291
SUSANNE EPPLE, The Bashada of Southern Ethiopia: A Study of	
Age, Gender and Social Discourse (ANGELA M. MÜLLER)	293
MARILYN HERMAN, Gondar's Child. Songs, Honor, and Identity	_,,
among Ethiopian Jews in Israel (CHARLOTTE TOUATI)	296
HUGUES FONTAINE, African Train/Un train en Afrique,	
Djibouti~Éthiopie (STÉPHANE ANCEL)	298
ፍጹም ፡ ወልደ ፡ ማርያም (Fiessum Wäldä Maryam), ያልተዘመረሳ	270
ቸው ፡ "ትልቅ ፡ ነበርን ፡ ትልቅም ፡ እንሆናለን" ('Those who have not	
been publicized enough: we were great and we will become great'),	
I and II (ABREHAM ADUGNA)	300
LUTZ EDZARD (ed.), Semitic and Afroasiatic: Challenges and	500
Opportunities (ALESSANDRO BAUSI)	302
Opportunities (Alessandro Dausi)	JU2

DAVID W. PHILLIPSON, Foundations of an African Civilisation: Aksum & the Northern Horn 1000 BC-AD 1300 = Eastern Africa Series, Woodbridge, Suffolk: James Currey – Rochester, NY: Boydell & Brewer Inc., 2012. 304 pp. Price: GB-€: 40.00. ISBN: 978-1-84701-041-4.

Increasing archaeological researches in the northern Horn of Africa, standing questions about the emergence of complex societies in this region, and a growing number of scholars and students interested in this field have highlighted the necessity for a synthesis of the current knowledge about the people who inhabited this area in the past and about the processes which led to the appearance of hierarchical societies at a state level of complexity in 1st millennium B.C./1st millennium A.D. Ethiopia and Eritrea.

Foundations of an African Civilisation by David Phillipson aims at responding to this challenge by presenting a critical outline of the present status of Ethiopian archaeology¹ and an updated overview of 1st millennium B.C. and early 2nd millennium A.D. Ethiopia and Eritrea, 14 years after the publication of *Ancient Ethiopia* by the same author.²

The book is organized in 3 parts and 16 chapters, with a general introduction (Chapter 1) and an epilogue (Chapter 18).

Part I focuses on the second and 1st millennium B.C. and provides an overview of the period immediately preceding the appearance of a literate complex society in this region at the beginning of the 1st millennium B.C. (Chapter 2). Furthermore, Part I describes the cultural changes that occurred along the 1st millennium B.C. which led to the progressive emergence of the Aksumite civilization (Chapter 3).

Part II (Chapters 4 to 16) indisputably represents the core of the book. After an introductory summary (Chapter 4), greater attention is dedicated to describing the emergence and expansion of Aksum's polity between the 1st and 6th centuries A.D. (Chapter 7), and gives a thematic outline of all major aspects of the Aksumite civilization: languages and literacy (Chapter 5), written sources (Chapter 6), kingship and politics (Chapter 8), religion (Chapter 9), subsistence economy (Chapter 10), urbanism and architecture (Chapter 11), funerary monuments and burial practices (Chapter 12), technology and material culture (Chapter 13), coinage (Chapter 14),

¹ In this article, references to "Ethiopian archaeology" or "Ethiopian studies" may be assumed to include Eritrea.

² Phillipson 1998.

and foreign contacts (Chapter 15). In Chapter 16³, Phillipson examines evidence on the decline of Aksum as a political centre and the hypothesis that there existed a progressive shift in eastern Tigray, which was at the core of the Ethiopian Christian civilization between the second half of the 7th century A.D. and the 11th century A.D.

Part III (Chapter 17) surveys the period between the early 11th and late 13th centuries A.D., during which the Agäw Zag^we dynasty flourished in the Lasta region, now part of Amhara region, establishing its capital city at the famous site of Lalibäla–Roha.

In the epilogue (Chapter 18), guidelines for future researches and strategies for heritage management are provided, and will be reviewed later in this article.

One of the strengths of this book, which becomes immediately noticeable while reading, is Phillipson's holistic approach to the study of ancient Ethiopia and Eritrea, by integrating data and methods from different disciplines. The author operates a successful attempt to provide an assessment of the ancient past of these two regions that is firmly grounded in archaeological data, project updates and evaluation of the sources, and is integrated with evidence from history, numismatic, philology, linguistics and environmental studies. The result of Phillipson's dependable work and accurate methodology is a comprehensive essay of the ancient history of Ethiopia and Eritrea, and a fundamental contribution to the scientific community for further discussions and debates.

Our comprehension of the archaeological development of Ethiopia and Eritrea expands as research projects progress, bringing new evidence to light. However, there are aspects of the archaeological history of these regions that have been largely studied or repeatedly revised and are now commonly accepted by scholars. Some criticism to this book lies with Phillipson's disregard for some well established models and shared opinions, that are crucial to facilitate the scientific debate and to advance our discipline as a whole.

One, quite striking example, in my opinion, is Phillipson's lack of adoption of the established archaeological periodisation between the early 1st millennium B.C. and the late 1st millennium A.D. Although the definition of the earliest phase, known as "Pre-Aksumite" culture (ca. 800/400 B.C.), is still largely debated,⁴ we have come to a common cultural development model as a result of multiple revisions of available data and increased chronometric precision. There is a well defined and reliable cultural sequence, at least for the area of

³ The hypothesis of a progressive shift in eastern Tigray at the core of Ethiopian Christianity is mostly based on the comparison between churches, architecture and layout, as proposed in detail in ID. 2009a.

⁴ ID. 2009b: 257–274; but also FATTOVICH 2012: 1–60.

Aksum, that marks the most significant cultural changes before, during and after the Aksumite civilization.⁵ Phillipson's acknowledgement of this shared tool would have facilitated comparative analyses of his ideas in the light of the most recent archaeological results, together with encouraging advances and further refinement of such a tool. It is in fact widely recognized by archaeologists working in this area the need of a confrontation on this topic in order to share the terminology used and to make data from different regions comparable.

Palaeoclimatic reconstruction theories also lack adequate representation in this book. Palaeoenvironmental studies conducted at various locations of the Tigrean plateau, provide a reliable reconstruction of the climatic fluctuations, that occurred in this region from the 1st millennium B.C. up to the present, providing relevant information and interesting insights on the role played by environmental conditions on the development and decline of the Aksumite civilization.6 These studies suggest that favourable climatic conditions between 500 B.C. and 500 A.D., might have significantly concurred, together with economic and social factors, to the emergence and expansion of Aksum's polity. Moreover, a significant contribution to our understanding of adaptation strategies adopted by ancient local communities to environmental and/or social pressure, comes from research projects recently conducted in the area of Aksum. These provided new insights for local-scale palaeoenvironmental reconstructions and the analysis of land-use and land management strategies by integrating recent data on Aksumite settlement patterns with geological, geoarchaeological and Palaeoagricultural observations.⁷

There yet remains opportunity to comment on some specific statements in the book that require clarification. In the first section of Chapter 3, dedicated to the first half of the 1st millennium B.C., the author describes (p. 33) the rock-cut shaft tombs similar to the ones excavated at Yəḥa, but associated to large stone-built platform and stelae recorded at Betä Giyorgis. This may be confusing, especially for non-specialized readers. It should be clear that those tombs refer to a later period (mostly to the second half of the 1st millennium B.C. and early 1st millennium A.D.). Also confusing is the statement on page 42, according to which it is uncertain whether all the stelae and burials present in the cemetery of "Ona Enda Aboi Zewge" (OAZ) at Betä Giyorgis are attributable to the second half of the 1st millen-

⁵ Fattovich – Bard – Petrassi – Pisano 2000: 72–75.

⁶ Brancaccio – Calderoni – Coltorti – Dramis – Ogbaghebriel 1997: 29–44; Machado – Pérez-Gonzàles – Benito 1998: 312–321.

⁷ Ciampalini - Manzo - Perlingieri - Sernicola 2006: 219–226; Sernicola - Sulas 2012: 549–573.

nium B.C. Excavations conducted at the site confirmed that this area has been used as a cemetery between the first half of the 1st millennium B.C. and the mid-4th century A.D.⁸ In chapter 13, it is argued (p. 161, main text and footnote 7) that local imitation of imported forms first occurred between the late-5th and early-7th centuries. Fragmentary ceramic vessels from Betä Giyorgis⁹ suggest that ceramic imitation of metal and glass vessels might have occurred since the late 1st millennium B.C./early 1st millennium A.D.,¹⁰ proving that this kind of vessels was already traded from the Mediterranean area, as also reported in the *Periplus of the Eritrean Sea* in the mid-1st century A.D.¹¹ Also the occurrence of imported ribbed-amphorae (the so-called "Ayla-Aksum" type), ascribed by the author (p. 197, footnote 17) to the mid-5th and the early 7th centuries A.D., can be anticipated on the base of excavated material.¹²

In spite of the elements of criticism summarized above, the value of this book as a general compendium and state-of-the-art publication of Ethiopian archaeology is undisputable.

In addition to the quantity and variety of the data presented, the book rightly emphasizes the uncertainties and gaps that characterize our knowledge on ancient Ethiopia and Eritrea, providing valuable guidelines and directions for future research. The book demonstrates our limited knowledge of the period preceding the early 1st millennium B.C., albeit there is evidence of the existence of complex societies in this area, and how little archeological research has been invested in the study of the periods following the decline of Aksum.

An important message that Phillipson sends out in his book, is that it is now time to start stronger collaborations, and interdisciplinary research projects to answer pending questions on ancient Ethiopia and Eritrea. Phillipson urges to move Ethiopian studies away from what has been defined by the author as a *pioneering research* stage (p. 246), characterised by isolated research initiatives, focused on specific cultural or chronological phases, more prominent sites and élite elements. The effectiveness of such an "integrative" approach is demonstrated by the author himself, who complemented historical sources with an archaeological approach for the reconstruction of a relative chronology of the Lalibela-Roha rock-hewn churches complexes.¹³ In Phillipson's scenario of long-term stronger collaborations and ad-

⁸ Fattovich – Bard – Petrassi – Pisano 2000: 50–55.

⁹ Manzo 2003: 7–46; Id. 2005: 54.

¹⁰ ID. 2003: 7–46; ID. 2005: 54.

¹¹ CASSON 1989: 53, par. 6.

¹² MANZO 2005: 57.

¹³ Phillipson 2009b: 257–274.

vances for the whole discipline, a fundamental role must be played by Ethiopian and Eritrean scholars and administrators. This book is in fact dedicated to the future leaders of Ethiopia and Eritrea, by placing in their hands a great part of responsibility for the future of their heritage in terms of both research lines and preservation strategies.

It is in fact stated by the author (p. 4), that his work is directed to three distinct audiences: specialists primarily interested in the northern Horn, archaeology students at Ethiopian universities, less specialized readers (mainly Ethiopian and Eritrean living in these countries or abroad, foreigners and tourists). The challenge of writing a detailed, comprehensive and updated account on Ethiopian/Eritrean past, which pays due attention to the precision and critical overview requested by specialised scholars and simultaneously meets the needs of clarity and readability of students and other readers is a serious one. Those reading Phillipson's book will discover how hard it must have been to find the right balance between such distant aims. The imposition of arbitrary new parameters is required. Nevertheless, the final result remains excellent as Phillipson's book is a useful working tool for scholars, a complete and updated textbook for students, and a readable and informative account for those who wish to be introduced to the past of these regions.

Bibliographic references

- BRANCACCIO, L. G. CALDERONI M. COLTORTI F. DRAMIS BERAKHI OGBAGHEBRIEL 1997, "Phases of Soil Erosion during the Holocene in the Highlands of Western Tigray (Northern Ethiopia): a Preliminary Report", in: K.A. BARD (ed.), *The Environmental History and Human Ecology of Northern Ethiopia in the Late Holocene: Preliminary Results of Multidisciplinary Project* = Studi Africanistici, Serie Etiopica 5, Napoli: Istituto Universitario Orientale, pp. 29–44.
- CASSON, L.L. 1989, Periplus Maris Erythraei: Text with Introduction, Translation and Commentary, Princeton: Princeton University Press.
- CIAMPALINI, R. A. MANZO C. PERLINGIERI L. SERNICOLA 2006, "Landscape Archaeology and GIS for the Eco-cultural Heritage Management of the Aksum Region, Ethiopia", in: S. CAMPANA M. FORTE (eds.), From Space to Place: 2nd International Conference on Remote Sensing in Archaeology. Proceedings of the 2nd International Workshop, CNR, Rome, Italy, December 4–7, 2006 = British Archaeological Reports, International Series 1568, Oxford: Archaeopress, pp. 219–226.
- FATTOVICH, R. 2012, "The northern Horn of Africa in the 1st millennium BCE: local traditions and external connections", *RSE* n.s. 4, pp. 1–60.
- K.A. BARD L. PETRASSI V. PISANO 2000, The Aksum Archaeological Area: a
 Preliminary Assessment = Istituto Universitario Orientale, Dipartimento di Studi Ricerche su Africa e Paesi Arabi, Laboratorio di Archeologia, Working Paper 1, Napoli: Istituto Universitario Orientale.

Reviews

- MACHADO, M.J. A. PÉREZ-GONZÀLES G. BENITO 1998, "Paleoenvironmental Changes during the Last 4000 yr in the Tigray, Northern Ethiopia", *Quaternary Research* 49, pp. 312–321.
- MANZO, A. 2003, "Skeuomorphism in Aksumite Pottery? Remarks on the Origins and Meaning of Some Ceramic Types", *Aethiopica* 6, pp. 7–46.
- 2005, "Aksumite Trade and the Red Sea Exchange Network: a View from Bieta Giyorgis (Aksum)", in: J.C.M. STARKEY (ed.), People of the Red Sea: Proceedings of Red Sea Project II held in the British Museum, October 2004 = British Archaeological Reports, International Series 1395, Oxford: Archaeopress, pp. 51–66.
- PHILLIPSON, D.W. 1998, Ancient Ethiopia: Aksum, its Antecedents and Successors, London: British Museum Press.
- 2009a, Ancient Churches of Ethiopia: Fourth-Fourteenth Centuries, New Haven, CT London: Yale University Press.
- 2009b, "The First Millennium BC in the Highlands of Northern Ethiopia and South-Central Eritrea: a Reassessment of Cultural and Political Development", African Archaeological Review 26, pp. 257–274.
- SERNICOLA, L. F. SULAS 2012, "Continuità e cambiamento nel paesaggio rurale di Aksum: dati archeologici, etnografici e paleoambientali", in: A. BAUSI A. BRITA A. MANZO con la collaborazione di C. BAFFIONI E. FRANCESCA (a c.), *Aethiopica et Orientalia: Studi in onore di Yaqob Beyene*, II = Studi Africanistici, Serie Etiopica 9, Napoli: Università di Napoli "L'Orientale", pp. 549–573.

Luisa Sernicola, Università di Napoli "L'Orientale"

KAI MERTEN, *Das äthiopisch-orthodoxe Christentum*: *Ein Versuch zu verstehen* = Studien zur Orientalischen Kirchengeschichte 44, Berlin: Lit Verlag, 2012. 348 Seiten. Preis: € 24,90. ISBN 978–3–643–11645–1.

Der evangelische Pfarrer und promovierte Theologe ist Wissenschaftlicher Mitarbeiter für Religionswissenschaft an der Goethe-Universität in Frankfurt am Main. Das Werk beruht nicht nur auf literarischen Quellen, sondern auch auf Beobachtungen, Erfahrungen und Begegnungen während seiner Aufenthalte in Äthiopien. Das Buch basiert auf einem religionswissenschaftlichen Seminar über die religiöse Landschaft Äthiopiens im Wintersemester 2010/11, und ist durch Anregungen von Studenten und Studentinnen ergänzt worden.

Das Werk ist in neun Abschnitte untergliedert.

1. Die Einleitung (S. 7–14); 2. Der Aufbau des Buches (S. 15–20); 3. Vorbemerkungen zur Umschrift äthiopischer Wörter (S. 21–22; die Umschrift der Fachbegriffe wird jedoch nicht konsequent durchgezogen); 4. Geschichtlicher Überblick (S. 23–53); 5. Die Glaubensvorstellungen des äthiopisch-orthodoxen Christentums vermitteln die Lehre, die Mythen und Legenden sowie die ethischen und sozialen Vorstellungen der äthiopischen Kirche (S. 54–151); 6. Das Glaubensleben des äthiopisch-orthodoxen Christentums stellt die